

**CITY OF HOLLYWOOD, FLORIDA
INTER-OFFICE MEMORANDUM
PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES**

DATE: June 22, 2010 **FILE:** 10-C-38

TO: Historic Preservation Board

VIA: Julie Walls Krolak, Principal Planner

FROM: Elizabeth Chang, Planning and Development Services Administrator

SUBJECT: Valerio Rabasco requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for exterior renovations to an existing single-family home located at 1449 Madison Street in the Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District.

APPLICANT REQUEST

Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovations to an existing single family home.

STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: Denial.

PROPOSED PROJECT

The applicant is proposing exterior renovations to an existing home. According to information provided by the Florida Master Site File, the house was constructed in 1924. Characteristic of vernacular architecture, this building represents the typical method of construction used by pioneers during the early period of development in Hollywood. The vernacular architectural style consisted of either a wood frame or masonry. As stated in the Site File, the home is of the wood vernacular architectural style with a stucco exterior. Wood frame vernacular buildings are noted for rectangular, symmetrical forms with wood siding of vertical or horizontal varieties. Masonry vernacular, however, consisted of exterior stone or cast concrete which can vary from smooth to rough textured. Concrete block and hollow clay tile have a stucco finish. Windows typically were double hung with a wood frame sash in a variety of light patterns. In some cases, casement windows were used.

Furthermore, the home is considered to be significant because it dates from the earliest construction period in Hollywood and was the primary residence of a historic figure, T.S. McNicol and his wife, Frances McNicol. T.S. McNicol served as postmaster from 1925-33 and later established the Hollywood Sun in 1935. Frances McNicol was among the first group of teachers in Hollywood who taught at a makeshift school which was based out of the first company sales pavilion and for whom McNicol Middle School (formerly known as McNicol Junior High) was named after.

The existing one-story home is approximately 1,300 sq ft and is on an approximate 0.17 acre plot. Proposed renovations include changing out the windows on the east, south, and west elevations to impact resistant single hung windows. The applicant performed work without obtaining a permit,

and as such, received a violation. Based on a history search performed by staff, the applicant made several changes to the window openings as well as closing two openings on the east and west sides. Additionally, information and a photo from the Site File shows the front elevation (south) previously existed as jalousie windows. The proposed windows do not match the pre-existing openings (Attachment B) and as such, are incompatible with the building's historic appearance resulting in a potential loss of its historic character. Additional improvements include replacing stucco in some areas and painting to match the existing color.

The Historic Preservation Board is guided by the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* and the City of Hollywood's *Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts*. These documents offer design controls for materials, scale, massing and location for all properties within the district. According to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, "*Identifying, retaining, and preserving windows – and their functional and decorative features – that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building,*" are recommended. Furthermore, it continues to state, "*Such features can include frames, sash, muntins, glazing, sills, heads, hoodmolds, paneled or decorated jambs and moldings, and interior and exterior shutters and blinds.*" Replacement should only occur if the existing window is too deteriorated to repair and should be done in a manner using the same sash and pane configuration and other design details, or with a compatible substitute material. The renovations are not consistent with the character of the Historic Lakes Section and have not been designed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards or the Design Guidelines.

SITE BACKGROUND

Applicants/Owners: Valerio Rabasco
Address/Location: 1449 Madison Street
Size of Property: approximately 0.17 acres
Present Zoning: Single Family Residential (RS-6)
Lakes Area Historic Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
Present Land Use: Single Family Residence
Year Built: 1924 (Florida Master Site File)

ADJACENT ZONING

North: Single Family Residential District (RS-6)
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
South: Single Family Residential District (RS-6)
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
East: Single Family Residential District (RS-6)
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)
West: Single Family Residential District (RS-6)
Lakes Area Multiple Resource Listing District (HMPRL0D-1)

CONSISTENCY WITH THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Within the Comprehensive Plan, the primary goal of the Land Use Element is to "promote a distribution of land uses that will enhance and improve the residential, business, resort and natural communities while allowing the land owners to maximize the use of their property." While the proposed renovations will allow the applicant to make the necessary improvements while maximizing the use of their property, it is not consistent with the Design Guidelines.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN

The City-Wide Master Plan (CWMP) places a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods. It addresses the need for strict design controls to maintain the individual character of each neighborhood. The proposed renovations are not sensitive to the character of the Historic Lakes Section through its design which is inconsistent to the previous window openings and style.

Policy CW.15: Place a priority on protecting, preserving and enhancing residential neighborhoods.

Policy 2.46 encourages the preservation of stable neighborhoods and rehabilitation initiatives that will revitalize and promote stability of neighborhoods.

CONSISTENCY WITH THE HOLLYWOOD LAKES NEIGHBORHOOD PLAN

The Hollywood Lakes Neighborhood Plan seeks to maintain and preserve the character and integrity of the existing residential community by protecting historical areas. It also seeks to eliminate the encroachment of negative residential uses.

The proposed renovations affect the integrity of the Historic District by changing the appearance of a contributing structure built in 1924. The home is considered to be significant because it dates from the earliest construction period in Hollywood. Additionally, it was the primary residence of a historic figure, T.S. McNicol and his wife, Frances McNicol. T.S. McNicol served as postmaster from 1925-33 and later established the Hollywood Sun in 1935. Frances McNicol was a teacher who taught at a makeshift Hollywood schoolhouse from 1924-25 and for whom McNicol Middle School (formerly known as McNicol Junior High) was named after. The original home is stated to be of wood vernacular architecture with a stucco exterior. The proposed renovations are incompatible with the buildings historic appearance resulting in a loss of the building historic character.

DECISIONS ON CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR DESIGN

A decision on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Design for new building construction, additions to existing building, major renovation work or substantial alteration shall be based upon evaluation of the compatibility of the physical alteration or improvement with and adherence to the criteria for designation listed in § 5.6.F.

Criteria: integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship and association.

CRITERION: INTEGRITY OF LOCATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts recommends *consistent spacing and setback*. Additionally, the Guidelines further recommend having the *main entrance oriented to the street* and *site coverage similar to adjacent lots*. The applicant is proposing exterior renovations to the home which consists of changing window openings. Setbacks and orientation of the building will be maintained. Lot proportions are consistent with other residences in the neighborhood and will not have negative impacts on adjacent properties.

According to information found in the Florida Master Site File, the house was constructed in 1924 and is of the wood vernacular architectural style with a stucco exterior. Wood frame vernacular buildings are noted for rectangular, symmetrical forms with wood siding of vertical or horizontal varieties. Windows typically were double hung with a wood frame sash in a variety of light patterns. In some cases, casement windows were used. A picture in the Site File indicates windows on the front elevation (south), once existed as jalousie windows.

FINDING: Consistent

CRITERION: DESIGN

ANALYSIS: According to the Florida Master Site File, the house is said to have been built in 1924. Renovations include changing out the windows on the east, south, and west elevations to impact resistant single-hung windows and closing a few window openings. However, based on a history search performed by staff, the applicant has made several alterations to the window openings.

Window openings have reduced significantly and style changed resulting in an altered historic appearance of the structure. According to the applicant, "Two front existing windows (south) will be replaced with impact resistant single hung windows and one window at the right side (east) and one window on the left side elevation (west) will be replaced with impact resistant single hung."

The previous windows were larger to allow for maximum interior daylighting and views which were common features of historic buildings. However, the new proposed windows have been reduced in size and are incompatible with the building's appearance resulting in a potential loss of its historic character. As seen in photos of the pre-existing windows and historical data, the windows once existed as jalousies or as double hung. Additional improvements include replacing stucco in some areas and painting to match the existing color.

According to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, "*Identifying, retaining, and preserving windows – and their functional and decorative features – that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building,*" are recommended. Furthermore, it continues to state, "*Such features can include frames, sash, muntins, glazing, sills, heads, hoodmolds, paneled or decorated jambs and moldings, and interior and exterior shutters and blinds.*" Replacement should only occur if the existing window is too deteriorated to repair and should be done in a manner using the same sash and pane configuration and other design details, or with a compatible substitute material. As such, window openings should remain in tact to its original form with window styles to be consistent with what previously existed. Additionally, exterior casings were used as a design element and should be restored.

FINDING: Inconsistent

CRITERION: SETTING

ANALYSIS: The Historic District Design Guidelines state *setting is the relationship of buildings within the Historic District and the surrounding site and neighborhood.* When making alterations or additions it is recommended *distinctive features such as size, mass, color, and materials of buildings* are retained. As stated by the architect, “The structure is single story wood frame structure. The residence was built in 1930 and due to the nature of wood structure it has been exposed to termites and deterioration of the wood. The areas of deterioration will be replace with new pressure treated wood, felt, and wire lath and stucco to match the existing smooth stucco. It has gable roof of shingle material which is in harmony with the neighborhood.”

The property is on an approximate 0.17 acre plot. Renovations include changing out the windows on the east, south, and west elevations to impact resistant single-hung windows. Based on a history search performed by staff, the applicant has made several changes to the window openings. The proposed windows do not match the pre-existing openings and as such, are incompatible with the building’s historic appearance resulting in a potential loss of its historic character.

FINDING: Inconsistent

CRITERION: MATERIALS

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts state *materials are an important part of the fabric of any historic district or property and help to maintain the historic character of the place.* Furthermore, *materials that are compatible in quality, color, texture, finish, and dimension to those that are in the historic district should be used. Designing new work which is incompatible with the other buildings in the neighborhood in materials, size, scale, and texture* should be avoided.

The applicant is proposing exterior renovations which include changing window openings on the east, south, and west sides. The openings have been significantly reduced and style changed resulting in a loss of its historic character. Additionally, two openings on the east and west have been closed. The use of single hung windows is consistent; however, the size in which they have been installed is not.

FINDING: Inconsistent

CRITERION: WORKMANSHIP

ANALYSIS: According to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, *“Identifying, retaining, and preserving windows – and their functional and decorative features – that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building,”* are recommended. Replacement should only occur if the existing window is too deteriorated to repair and should be done in a manner using the same

sash and pane configuration and other design details, or with a compatible substitute material. The renovations are not consistent with the character of the Historic Lakes Section and have not been designed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards or the Design Guidelines.

FINDING: Inconsistent

CRITERION: ASSOCIATION

ANALYSIS: Design Guidelines for Historic Properties and Districts recommend avoiding incorporating elements which are incompatible with other buildings in the neighborhood in materials, size, scale, and texture. While the proposed windows are consistent with other properties in the neighborhood, alteration of window openings have affected the character of the home and thus, altered its association with surrounding properties.

FINDING: Inconsistent

RECOMMENDATION

Certificate of Appropriateness for Design: Denial.

ATTACHMENTS

ATTACHMENT A: Application Package
ATTACHMENT B: Pre-existing Windows
ATTACHMENT C: Aerial Photograph